

A question about works of Albani

Answer by renowned writer Muhammad Mubashir Nazir

---

Question:

Dear Brother

Assalam o alaikum

Have you heard about Sadeq Gumareh (late), or Ahmed Darwish. They are sufi scholars. I also had talk with Ahmed Darwish via email. He also told me to take 10 major books of Ahadith in which I will find about above 90 % hadith. They are very much against Nasir Uddeen Albany. He told me that we are in disagreement with Nasir Uddeen Albany in about 4000 Hadith.

Kazi

Hyderabad, Pakistan

Dear Brother

Wa alaikum us salam wa Rahmatullah

I'm not much aware about the Sufi Scholars you've mentioned. Mr. Ahmed Darwesh has correctly mentioned to you that 90% of Ahadith are available in 10-12 books (i.e Sihah Sitta + Musnad Ahmed + Tabrani + Musannaf Ibn Ibe Sheba + Musannaf Abd ur Razzaq + Mustadrak Hakim).

Regarding his disagreement with Albani, it is the right of everyone to agree or disagree based on arguments. Albani has done a marvelous job in identifying the real vs. fake Ahadith. But definitely he was not a prophet. We should not be his blind followers. We should evaluate the work of Albani as well as that of his critics in an unbiased manner.

Albani has based his work on sound arguments. If Darwesh disagrees with him on any particular Hadith, he should bring forth his arguments. It will be a hard job. For example, if Albani rejects a Hadith based on the argument that a narrator X in the sanad (chain of narrators) of that Hadith is found unreliable. He presents evidence about unreliability of Mr. X from ancient experts of Jirh wa Ta'adeel (the process of evaluation of reliability of Hadith narrators) like Ahmed Ibn Hanbal, Hatim, Yahya Ibn Mu'een etc.

Now if a person disagrees with Albani, he has to provide evidence from the same level of experts of Jirh wa Ta'adeel that Mr. X was a reliable person. If such evidence is available, we should compare that with the evidence provided by Albani in order to reach at a conclusion. But if such evidence is not available, then that disagreement is nothing except an unproved claim which has no place in the world of academics.

I hope this detail will help you. Since you have a strong interest in religious studies, so why not to develop your own skills in all these religious disciplines in order to evaluate the information yourself.

I have made it the objective of my life to make such disciplines available to everyone and now working on it day and night. Just see the following link which provides an outline of this project:

<http://www.mubashirnazir.org/Courses/IS001-00-Studiesurdu.htm>

If you are interested in this project, I'll cordially invite you to join me in that. Please feel free to ask any question or to share your views about it.

Remember in your prayers during Ramadan

wassalaam

Mubashir

Sep 2009

Assalam U Alaekum

Ahmed Darwish is the owner of sites Allah.com and Muhammad.com. I asked a scholar about the disagreement of about 4000 Ahadith, he said that is too much. He said Imam Albani has made mistakes, but he says that this number is quite too much, it cannot be true. I saw your course, I will study it when I get time. I will ask you about certain questions once I get to read my interested subjects in your course.

Have you seen Imam Albani's article on wikipedia.org. I am astonished to see how much people hate him. Wikipedia is supposed to be neutral but I myself cannot comment on that article with its heavy criticism of Imam Albani. Wassalam

Wa alaikum us salam wa Rahmatullah

About Albani, yes 4000 Ahadith is an exaggeration. Anyway, we should compare both views based on their arguments in an unbiased manner in order to reach at a conclusion.

The criticism on Albani is mainly from Sufis because the entire building of Sufism is constructed on Fake Ahadith. Unfortunately, it has become a common attitude in Muslims. When they agree with a person, they love him. They are not satisfied unless they raise him to the position of a prophet. Considering a person the criteria for the right and the wrong is considering him equivalent to a prophet.

On the contrary, if they disagree with a person, they convert their disagreement into hatred. Then they try to degrade that person by all means.

We should seek refuge of Allah from such attitude. We should try to be unbiased because it is the requirement of the Holy Quran to be just.

Please feel free to ask the questions after reading that material.

wassalaam

Mubashir

Sep 2009